

**CHAPTER 28-32**  
**ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES PRACTICE ACT**

**28-32-01. Definitions.**

In this chapter, unless the context or subject matter otherwise provides:

1. "Adjudicative proceeding" means an administrative matter resulting in an agency issuing an order after an opportunity for hearing is provided or required. An adjudicative proceeding includes administrative matters involving a hearing on a complaint against a specific-named respondent; a hearing on an application seeking a right, privilege, or an authorization from an agency, such as a ratemaking or licensing hearing; or a hearing on an appeal to an agency. An adjudicative proceeding includes reconsideration, rehearing, or reopening. Once an adjudicative proceeding has begun, the adjudicative proceeding includes any informal disposition of the administrative matter under section 28-32-22 or another specific statute or rule, unless the matter has been specifically converted to another type of proceeding under section 28-32-22. An adjudicative proceeding does not include a decision or order to file or not to file a complaint, or to initiate an investigation, an adjudicative proceeding, or any other proceeding before the agency, or another agency, or a court. An adjudicative proceeding does not include a decision or order to issue, reconsider, or reopen an order that precedes an opportunity for hearing or that under another section of this code is not subject to review in an adjudicative proceeding. An adjudicative proceeding does not include rulemaking under this chapter.
2. "Administrative agency" or "agency" means each board, bureau, commission, department, or other administrative unit of the executive branch of state government, including one or more officers, employees, or other persons directly or indirectly purporting to act on behalf or under authority of the agency. An administrative unit located within or subordinate to an administrative agency must be treated as part of that agency to the extent it purports to exercise authority subject to this chapter. The term administrative agency does not include:
  - a. The office of management and budget except with respect to rules made under section 32-12.2-14, rules relating to conduct on the capitol grounds and in buildings located on the capitol grounds under section 54-21-18, rules relating to the classified service as authorized under section 54-44.3-07, and rules relating to state purchasing practices as required under section 54-44.4-04.
  - b. The adjutant general with respect to the department of emergency services.
  - c. The council on the arts.
  - d. The state auditor.
  - e. The department of commerce with respect to the division of economic development and finance.
  - f. The dairy promotion commission.
  - g. The education factfinding commission.
  - h. The kindergarten through grade twelve education coordination council.
  - i. The board of equalization.
  - j. The board of higher education.
  - k. The Indian affairs commission.
  - l. The industrial commission with respect to the activities of the Bank of North Dakota, North Dakota housing finance agency, public finance authority, North Dakota mill and elevator association, North Dakota farm finance agency, the North Dakota transmission authority, and the North Dakota pipeline authority.
  - m. The department of corrections and rehabilitation except with respect to the activities of the division of adult services under chapter 54-23.4.
  - n. The pardon advisory board.
  - o. The parks and recreation department.
  - p. The parole board.
  - q. The state fair association.

- r. The attorney general with respect to activities of the state toxicologist and the state crime laboratory.
  - s. The administrative committee on veterans' affairs except with respect to rules relating to the supervision and government of the veterans' home and the implementation of programs or services provided by the veterans' home.
  - t. The industrial commission with respect to the lignite research fund except as required under section 57-61-01.5.
  - u. The attorney general with respect to guidelines adopted under section 12.1-32-15 for the risk assessment of sexual offenders, the risk level review process, and public disclosure of information under section 12.1-32-15.
  - v. The commission on legal counsel for indigents.
  - w. The attorney general with respect to twenty-four seven sobriety program guidelines and program fees.
  - x. The industrial commission with respect to approving or setting water rates under chapter 61-40.
  - y. The board of university and school lands with respect to the adjudicative proceeding requirements and procedures under sections 28-32-21 through 28-32-51.
3. "Agency head" means an individual or body of individuals in whom the ultimate legal authority of the agency is vested by law.
  4. "Commission" means the North Dakota ethics commission established by article XIV of the Constitution of North Dakota.
  5. "Complainant" means any person who files a complaint before an administrative agency pursuant to section 28-32-21 and any administrative agency that, when authorized by law, files such a complaint before such agency or any other agency.
  6. "Hearing officer" means any agency head or one or more members of the agency head when presiding in an administrative proceeding, or, unless prohibited by law, one or more other persons designated by the agency head to preside in an administrative proceeding, an administrative law judge from the office of administrative hearings, or any other person duly assigned, appointed, or designated to preside in an administrative proceeding pursuant to statute or rule.
  7. "License" means a franchise, permit, certification, approval, registration, charter, or similar form of authorization required by law.
  8. "Order" means any agency action of particular applicability which determines the legal rights, duties, privileges, immunities, or other legal interests of one or more specific persons. The term does not include an executive order issued by the governor.
  9. "Party" means each person named or admitted as a party or properly seeking and entitled as of right to be admitted as a party. An administrative agency may be a party. In a hearing for the suspension, revocation, or disqualification of an operator's license under title 39, the term may include each city and each county in which the alleged conduct occurred, but the city or county may not appeal the decision of the hearing officer.
  10. "Person" includes an individual, association, partnership, corporation, limited liability company, the commission, a state governmental agency or governmental subdivision, or an agency of such governmental subdivision.
  11. "Relevant evidence" means evidence having any tendency to make the existence of any fact that is of consequence to the determination of the administrative action more probable or less probable than it would be without the evidence.
  12. "Rule" means the whole or a part of an agency or commission statement of general applicability which implements or prescribes law or policy or the organization, procedure, or practice requirements of the agency or commission. The term includes the adoption of new rules and the amendment, repeal, or suspension of an existing rule. The term does not include:
    - a. A rule concerning only the internal management of an agency or the commission which does not directly or substantially affect the substantive or procedural rights or duties of any segment of the public.

- b. A rule that sets forth criteria or guidelines to be used by the staff of an agency or the commission in the performance of audits, investigations, inspections, and settling commercial disputes or negotiating commercial arrangements, or in the defense, prosecution, or settlement of cases, if the disclosure of the rule would:
  - (1) Enable law violators to avoid detection;
  - (2) Facilitate disregard of requirements imposed by law; or
  - (3) Give a clearly improper advantage to persons who are in an adverse position to the state.
- c. A rule establishing specific prices to be charged for particular goods or services sold by an agency.
- d. A rule concerning only the physical servicing, maintenance, or care of agency-owned, agency-operated, commission-owned, or commission-operated facilities or property.
- e. A rule relating only to the use of a particular facility or property owned, operated, or maintained by the state or any of its subdivisions, if the substance of the rule is adequately indicated by means of signs or signals to persons who use the facility or property.
- f. A rule concerning only inmates of a correctional or detention facility, students enrolled in an educational institution, or patients admitted to a hospital, if adopted by that facility, institution, or hospital.
- g. A form whose contents or substantive requirements are prescribed by rule or statute or are instructions for the execution or use of the form.
- h. An agency or commission budget.
- i. An opinion of the attorney general.
- j. A rule adopted by an agency selection committee under section 54-44.7-03.
- k. Any material, including a guideline, interpretive statement, statement of general policy, manual, brochure, or pamphlet, which is explanatory and not intended to have the force and effect of law.

**28-32-02. Rulemaking power of agency - Organizational rule.**

1. The authority of an administrative agency to adopt administrative rules is authority delegated by the legislative assembly. As part of that delegation, the legislative assembly reserves to itself the authority to determine when and if rules of administrative agencies are effective. Every administrative agency may adopt, amend, or repeal reasonable rules in conformity with this chapter and any statute administered or enforced by the agency. An administrative agency may not adopt a rule that prescribes a criminal penalty unless authorized by another chapter.
2. In addition to other rulemaking requirements imposed by law, each agency may include in its rules a description of that portion of its organization and functions subject to this chapter and may include a statement of the general course and method of its operations and how the public may obtain information or make submissions or requests.

**28-32-03. Emergency rules.**

1. If the agency, with the approval of the governor, or the commission finds that emergency rulemaking is necessary, the commission or agency may declare the proposed rule to be an interim final rule effective on a date no earlier than the date of filing with the legislative council of the notice required by section 28-32-10.
2. A proposed rule may be given effect on an emergency basis under this section if any of the following grounds exists regarding that rule:
  - a. Imminent peril threatens public health, safety, or welfare, which would be abated by emergency effectiveness;
  - b. A delay in the effective date of the rule is likely to cause a loss of funds appropriated to support a duty imposed by law upon the commission or agency;
  - c. Emergency effectiveness is reasonably necessary to avoid a delay in implementing an appropriations measure; or

- d. Emergency effectiveness is necessary to meet a mandate of federal law.
3. A final rule adopted after consideration of all written and oral submissions respecting the interim final rule, which is substantially similar to the interim final rule, is effective as of the declared effective date of the interim final rule.
4. The commission's or agency's finding, and a brief statement of the commission's or agency's reasons for the finding, must be filed with the legislative council with the final adopted emergency rule.
5. The commission or agency shall attempt to make interim final rules known to persons who the commission or agency can reasonably be expected to believe may have a substantial interest in them. As used in this subsection, "substantial interest" means an interest in the effect of the rules which surpasses the common interest of all citizens. The commission or an agency adopting emergency rules shall comply with the notice requirements of section 28-32-10 which relate to emergency rules and shall provide notice to the chairman of the administrative rules committee of the emergency status, declared effective date, and grounds for emergency status of the rules under subsection 2. When notice of emergency rule adoption is received, the legislative council shall publish the notice and emergency rules on its website.
6. An interim final rule is ineffective one hundred eighty days after its declared effective date unless first adopted as a final rule.

**28-32-04. Repeal or waiver of rules from federal guidelines.**

1. An agency shall repeal or amend any existing rule that was adopted from federal guidelines and which is not relevant to state regulatory programs.
2. An agency may not adopt rules from federal guidelines which are not relevant to state regulatory programs when developing or modifying programs.
3. An agency shall seek a waiver from the appropriate United States agency when the United States agency is evaluating current programs or delegating or modifying programs to relieve the agency from complying with or adopting rules that are not relevant to state regulatory programs.

**28-32-05. Adoption by reference of certain rules.**

1. When adopting rules, an agency shall adopt by reference any applicable existing permit or procedural rules that may be adapted for use in a new or existing program.
2. An agency shall seek authorization from the appropriate United States agency to adopt by reference applicable existing permit or procedural rules that may be adapted for use in a new or existing program when the United States agency is delegating or modifying a program.

**28-32-06. Force and effect of rules.**

Upon becoming effective, rules have the force and effect of law until amended or repealed by the agency or commission, declared invalid by a final court decision, suspended or found to be void by the administrative rules committee, or determined repealed by the legislative council because the authority for adoption of the rules is repealed or transferred to another agency.

**28-32-07. Deadline for rules to implement statutory change.**

Any rule change, including a creation, amendment, or repeal, made to implement a statutory change must be adopted and filed with the legislative council within nine months of the effective date of the statutory change. If an agency or the commission needs additional time for the rule change, a request for additional time must be made to the legislative council. The legislative council may extend the time within which the agency or commission must adopt the rule change if the request by the agency or commission is supported by evidence that the agency or commission needs more time through no deliberate fault of its own.

**28-32-08. Regulatory analysis.**

1. An agency or the commission shall issue a regulatory analysis of a proposed rule if:

- a. Within twenty days after the last published notice date of a proposed rule hearing, a written request for the analysis is filed by the governor or a member of the legislative assembly; or
  - b. The proposed rule is expected to have an impact on the regulated community in excess of fifty thousand dollars. The analysis under this subdivision must be available on or before the first date of public notice as provided for in section 28-32-10.
2. The regulatory analysis must contain:
    - a. A description of the classes of persons who probably will be affected by the proposed rule, including classes that will bear the costs of the proposed rule and classes that will benefit from the proposed rule;
    - b. A description of the probable impact, including economic impact, of the proposed rule;
    - c. The probable costs to the agency or commission of the implementation and enforcement of the proposed rule and any anticipated effect on state revenues; and
    - d. A description of any alternative methods for achieving the purpose of the proposed rule that were seriously considered by the agency or commission and the reasons why the methods were rejected in favor of the proposed rule.
  3. Each regulatory analysis must include quantification of the data to the extent practicable.
  4. The agency or commission shall mail or deliver a copy of the regulatory analysis to any person who requests a copy of the regulatory analysis. The agency or commission may charge a fee for a copy of the regulatory analysis as allowed under section 44-04-18.
  5. If required under subsection 1, the preparation and issuance of a regulatory analysis is a mandatory duty of the agency or commission proposing a rule. Errors in a regulatory analysis, including erroneous determinations concerning the impact of the proposed rule on the regulated community, are not a ground upon which the invalidity of a rule may be asserted or declared.

**28-32-08.1. Rules affecting small entities - Analysis - Economic impact statements - Judicial review.**

1. As used in this section:
  - a. "Small business" means a business entity, including its affiliates, which:
    - (1) Is independently owned and operated; and
    - (2) Employs fewer than twenty-five full-time employees or has gross annual sales of less than two million five hundred thousand dollars;
  - b. "Small entity" includes small business, small organization, and small political subdivision;
  - c. "Small organization" means any not-for-profit enterprise that is independently owned and operated and is not dominant in its field; and
  - d. "Small political subdivision" means a political subdivision with a population of less than five thousand.
2. Before adoption of any proposed rule, the adopting agency shall prepare a regulatory analysis in which, consistent with public health, safety, and welfare, the agency considers utilizing regulatory methods that will accomplish the objectives of applicable statutes while minimizing adverse impact on small entities. The agency shall consider each of the following methods of reducing impact of the proposed rule on small entities:
  - a. Establishment of less stringent compliance or reporting requirements for small entities;
  - b. Establishment of less stringent schedules or deadlines for compliance or reporting requirements for small entities;
  - c. Consolidation or simplification of compliance or reporting requirements for small entities;

- d. Establishment of performance standards for small entities to replace design or operational standards required in the proposed rule; and
  - e. Exemption of small entities from all or any part of the requirements contained in the proposed rule.
3. Before adoption of any proposed rule that may have an adverse impact on small entities, the adopting agency shall prepare an economic impact statement that includes consideration of:
    - a. The small entities subject to the proposed rule;
    - b. The administrative and other costs required for compliance with the proposed rule;
    - c. The probable cost and benefit to private persons and consumers who are affected by the proposed rule;
    - d. The probable effect of the proposed rule on state revenues; and
    - e. Any less intrusive or less costly alternative methods of achieving the purpose of the proposed rule.
  4. For any rule subject to this section, a small entity that is adversely affected or aggrieved by final agency action is entitled to judicial review of agency compliance with the requirements of this section. A small entity seeking judicial review under this section must file a petition for judicial review within one year from the date of final agency action.
  5. This section does not apply to the ethics commission, any agency that is an occupational or professional licensing authority, and the following agencies or divisions of agencies:
    - a. Council on the arts.
    - b. Beef commission.
    - c. Dairy promotion commission.
    - d. Dry bean council.
    - e. Highway patrolmen's retirement board.
    - f. Indian affairs commission.
    - g. Board for Indian scholarships.
    - h. State personnel board.
    - i. Potato council.
    - j. Board of public school education.
    - k. Real estate trust account committee.
    - l. Seed commission.
    - m. Soil conservation committee.
    - n. Oilseed council.
    - o. Wheat commission.
    - p. State seed arbitration board.
    - q. North Dakota lottery.
  6. This section does not apply to rules mandated by federal law.
  7. The adopting agency shall provide the administrative rules committee copies of any regulatory analysis or economic impact statement, or both, prepared under this section when the committee is considering the associated rules.

**28-32-08.2. Fiscal notes for rules.**

When an agency or the commission presents rules for administrative rules committee consideration, the agency or commission shall provide a fiscal note or a statement in its testimony that the rules have no fiscal effect. A fiscal note must reflect the effect of the rules changes on state revenues and expenditures, including any effect on funds controlled by the agency or commission.

**28-32-09. Takings assessment.**

1. An agency or the commission shall prepare a written assessment of the constitutional takings implications of a proposed rule that may limit the use of private real property. The assessment must:

- a. Assess the likelihood that the proposed rule may result in a taking or regulatory taking.
  - b. Clearly and specifically identify the purpose of the proposed rule.
  - c. Explain why the proposed rule is necessary to substantially advance that purpose and why no alternative action is available that would achieve the agency's or commission's goals while reducing the impact on private property owners.
  - d. Estimate the potential cost to the government if a court determines that the proposed rule constitutes a taking or regulatory taking.
  - e. Identify the source of payment within the agency's or commission's budget for any compensation that may be ordered.
  - f. Certify that the benefits of the proposed rule exceed the estimated compensation costs.
2. Any private landowner who is or may be affected by a rule that limits the use of the landowner's private real property may request in writing that the agency or commission reconsider the application or need for the rule. Within thirty days of receiving the request, the agency or commission shall consider the request and shall in writing inform the landowner whether the agency or commission intends to keep the rule in place, modify application of the rule, or repeal the rule.
  3. In an analysis of the takings implications of a proposed rule, "taking" means the taking of private real property, as defined in section 47-01-03, by government action which requires compensation to the owner of that property by the fifth or fourteenth amendment to the Constitution of the United States or section 16 of article I of the Constitution of North Dakota. "Regulatory taking" means a taking of real property through the exercise of the police and regulatory powers of the state which reduces the value of the real property by more than fifty percent. However, the exercise of a police or regulatory power does not effect a taking if it substantially advances legitimate state interests, does not deny an owner economically viable use of the owner's land, or is in accordance with applicable state or federal law.

**28-32-10. Notice of rulemaking - Hearing date.**

1. An agency or the commission shall prepare a full notice and an abbreviated notice of rulemaking.
  - a. The full notice of the proposed adoption, amendment, or repeal of a rule must include a short, specific explanation of the proposed rule and the purpose of the proposed rule, identify the emergency status and declared effective date of any emergency rules, include a determination of whether the proposed rulemaking is expected to have an impact on the regulated community in excess of fifty thousand dollars, identify at least one location where interested persons may review the text of the proposed rule, provide the address to which written comments concerning the proposed rule may be sent, provide the deadline for submission of written comments, provide a telephone number and post-office or electronic mail address at which a copy of the rules and regulatory analysis may be requested, and, in the case of a substantive rule, provide the time and place set for each oral hearing. An agency's full notice must include a statement of the bill number and general subject matter of any legislation, enacted during the most recent session of the legislative assembly, which is being implemented by the proposed rule. The commission's full notice must include a statement of the provision of the Constitution of North Dakota or the bill number and general subject matter of any legislation that is being implemented by the proposed rule. The full notice must be filed with the legislative council, accompanied by a copy of the proposed rules.
  - b. The agency or commission shall request publication of an abbreviated newspaper publication notice at least once in each official county newspaper published in this state. The abbreviated newspaper publication of notice must be in a display-type format with a minimum width of one column of approximately two inches [5.08 centimeters] and a minimum depth of approximately three inches

[7.62 centimeters] and with a headline describing the general topic of the proposed rules. The notice must also include the telephone number or address to use to obtain a copy of the proposed rules, identification of the emergency status and declared effective date of any emergency rules, the address to use and the deadline to submit written comments, and the location, date, and time of the public hearing on the rules.

2. The agency or commission shall mail or deliver by electronic mail a copy of the full notice and proposed rule to each member of the legislative assembly whose name appeared as a sponsor or cosponsor of legislation, enacted during the most recent session of the legislative assembly, which is being implemented by the proposed rule and to each person who has made a timely request to the agency or commission for a copy of the notice and proposed rule. The agency or commission may mail or otherwise provide a copy of the full notice to any person who is likely to be an interested person. The agency or commission may charge persons who are not members of the legislative assembly fees for copies of the proposed rule as allowed under section 44-04-18.
3. In addition to the other notice requirements of this subsection, the superintendent of public instruction shall provide notice of any proposed rulemaking by the superintendent of public instruction to each association with statewide membership whose primary focus is elementary and secondary education issues which has requested to receive notice from the superintendent under this subsection and to the superintendent of each public school district in this state, or the president of the school board for school districts that have no superintendent, at least twenty days before the date of the hearing described in the notice. Notice provided by the superintendent of public instruction under this section must be by first-class mail. However, upon request of a group or person entitled to notice under this section, the superintendent of public instruction shall provide the group or person notice by electronic mail.
4. The legislative council shall establish standard procedures for the commission and all agencies to follow in complying with the provisions of this section and a procedure to allow any person to request and receive mailed copies of all filings made by agencies and the commission pursuant to this section. The legislative council may charge an annual fee as established by the administrative rules committee for providing copies of the filings.
5. At least twenty days must elapse between the date of the publication of the notice and the date of the hearing. Within fifteen business days after receipt of a notice under this section, a copy of the notice must be mailed by the legislative council to any person who has paid the annual fee established under subsection 4.

**28-32-11. Conduct of hearings - Notice of administrative rules committee consideration - Consideration and written record of comments.**

The agency or commission shall adopt a procedure whereby all interested persons are afforded reasonable opportunity to submit data, views, or arguments, orally or in writing, concerning the proposed rule, including data respecting the impact of the proposed rule. The agency or commission shall adopt a procedure to allow interested parties to request and receive notice from the agency or commission of the date and place the rule will be reviewed by the administrative rules committee. In case of substantive rules, the agency or commission shall conduct an oral hearing. The agency or commission shall consider fully all written and oral submissions respecting a proposed rule prior to the adoption, amendment, or repeal of any rule not of an emergency nature. The agency or commission shall make a written record of its consideration of all written and oral submissions contained in the rulemaking record respecting a proposed rule.

**28-32-12. Comment period.**

The agency or commission shall allow, after the conclusion of any rulemaking hearing, a comment period of at least ten days during which data, views, or arguments concerning the



proposed rulemaking will be received by the agency or commission and made a part of the rulemaking record to be considered by the agency or commission.

**28-32-13. Substantial compliance with rulemaking procedure.**

A rule is invalid unless adopted in substantial compliance with this chapter. However, inadvertent failure to supply any person with a notice required by section 28-32-10 does not invalidate a rule. Notwithstanding subsection 2 of section 28-32-42, an action to contest the validity of a rule on the grounds of noncompliance with this chapter may not be commenced more than two years after the effective date of the rule.

**28-32-14. Attorney general review of rules.**

Every rule proposed by any administrative agency must be submitted to the attorney general for an opinion as to its legality before final adoption, and the attorney general promptly shall furnish each such opinion. The attorney general may not approve any rule as to legality when the rule exceeds the statutory authority of the agency or is written in a manner that is not concise or easily understandable or when the procedural requirements for adoption of the rule in this chapter are not substantially met. The attorney general shall advise an agency of any revision or rewording of a rule necessary to correct objections as to legality.

**28-32-15. Filing of rules for publication - Effective date of rules.**

1. A copy of each rule adopted by an administrative agency or the commission, a copy of each written comment and a written summary of each oral comment on the rule, and the attorney general's opinion on the rule, if any, must be filed by the adopting agency or commission with the legislative council for publication of the rule in the North Dakota Administrative Code.
2. a. Nonemergency rules approved by the attorney general as to legality, adopted by an administrative agency or the commission, filed with the legislative council, and not voided or held for consideration by the administrative rules committee become effective according to the following schedule:
  - (1) Rules filed with the legislative council from August second through November first become effective on the immediately succeeding January first.
  - (2) Rules filed with the legislative council from November second through February first become effective on the immediately succeeding April first.
  - (3) Rules filed with the legislative council from February second through May first become effective on the immediately succeeding July first.
  - (4) Rules filed with the legislative council from May second through August first become effective on the immediately succeeding October first.
- b. If publication is delayed for any reason other than action of the administrative rules committee, nonemergency rules, unless otherwise provided, become effective when publication would have occurred but for the delay.
- c. A rule held for consideration by the administrative rules committee becomes effective on the first effective date of rules under the schedule in subdivision a following the meeting at which that rule is reconsidered by the committee.

**28-32-16. Petition for reconsideration of rule - Hearing.**

Any person substantially interested in the effect of a rule adopted by an administrative agency or the commission may petition the agency or commission for a reconsideration of the rule or for an amendment or repeal of the rule. The petition must state clearly and concisely the petitioners' alleged grounds for reconsideration or the proposed repeal or amendment of the rule. The agency or commission may grant the petitioner a public hearing on the terms and conditions the agency prescribes.

### **28-32-17. Administrative rules committee objection.**

If the legislative management's administrative rules committee objects to all or any portion of a rule because the committee deems it to be unreasonable, arbitrary, capricious, or beyond the authority delegated to the adopting agency, the committee may file that objection in certified form with the legislative council. The filed objection must contain a concise statement of the committee's reasons for its action.

1. The legislative council shall attach to each objection a certification of the time and date of its filing and, as soon as possible, shall transmit a copy of the objection and the certification to the agency adopting the rule in question. The legislative council also shall maintain a permanent register of all committee objections.
2. The legislative council shall publish an objection filed pursuant to this section in the next issue of the code supplement. In case of a filed committee objection to a rule subject to the exceptions of the definition of rule in section 28-32-01, the agency shall indicate the existence of that objection adjacent to the rule in any compilation containing that rule.
3. Within fourteen days after the filing of a committee objection to a rule, the adopting agency shall respond in writing to the committee. After receipt of the response, the committee may withdraw or modify its objection.
4. After the filing of a committee objection, the burden of persuasion is upon the agency in any action for judicial review or for enforcement of the rule to establish that the whole or portion thereof objected to is within the procedural and substantive authority delegated to the agency. If the agency fails to meet its burden of persuasion, the court shall declare the whole or portion of the rule objected to invalid and judgment must be rendered against the agency for court costs. These court costs must include a reasonable attorney's fee and must be payable from the appropriation of the agency which adopted the rule in question.

### **28-32-18. Administrative rules committee may void rule - Grounds - Amendment by agreement of agency and committee.**

1. The legislative management's administrative rules committee may find that all or any portion of a rule is void if that rule is initially considered by the committee not later than the fifteenth day of the month before the date of the administrative code supplement in which the rule change is scheduled to appear. The administrative rules committee may find a rule or portion of a rule void if the committee makes the specific finding that, with regard to that rule or portion of a rule, there is:
  - a. An absence of statutory authority.
  - b. An emergency relating to public health, safety, or welfare.
  - c. A failure to comply with express legislative intent or to substantially meet the procedural requirements of this chapter for adoption of the rule.
  - d. A conflict with state law.
  - e. Arbitrariness and capriciousness.
  - f. A failure to make a written record of its consideration of written and oral submissions respecting the rule under section 28-32-11.
2. The administrative rules committee may find a rule void at the meeting at which the rule is initially considered by the committee or may hold consideration of that rule for one subsequent meeting. If no representative of the agency appears before the administrative rules committee when rules are scheduled for committee consideration, those rules are held over for consideration at the next subsequent committee meeting. Rules are not considered initially considered by the committee under this subsection until a representative of the agency appears before the administrative rules committee when the rules are scheduled for committee consideration. If no representative of the agency appears before the administrative rules committee meeting to which rules are held over for consideration, the rules are void if the rules were adopted as emergency rules and for rules not adopted as emergency rules the administrative rules committee may void the rules, allow the rules to become effective, or hold over consideration of the rules to the next subsequent committee meeting. Within three business days after

the administrative rules committee finds that a rule is void, the legislative council shall provide written notice of that finding and the committee's specific finding under subdivisions a through f of subsection 1 to the adopting agency and to the chairman of the legislative management. Within fourteen days after receipt of the notice, the adopting agency may file a petition with the chairman of the legislative management for review by the legislative management of the decision of the administrative rules committee. If the adopting agency does not file a petition for review, the rule becomes void on the fifteenth day after the notice from the legislative council to the adopting agency. If within sixty days after receipt of the petition from the adopting agency the legislative management has not disapproved by motion the finding of the administrative rules committee, the rule is void.

3. An agency may amend or repeal a rule or create a related rule if, after consideration of rules by the administrative rules committee, the agency and committee agree that the rule amendment, repeal, or creation is necessary to address any of the considerations under subsection 1. A rule amended, repealed, or created under this subsection is not subject to the other requirements of this chapter relating to adoption of administrative rules and may be published by the legislative council as amended, repealed, or created. If requested by the agency or any interested party, a rule amended, repealed, or created under this subsection must be reconsidered by the administrative rules committee at a subsequent meeting at which public comment on the agreed rule change must be allowed.

#### **28-32-18.1. Administrative rules committee review of existing rules.**

1. Upon request by the administrative rules committee, an administrative agency or the commission shall brief the committee on its existing rules and point out any provisions that appear to be obsolete and any areas in which statutory or constitutional authority has changed or been repealed since the rules were adopted or amended.
2. An agency or the commission may amend or repeal a rule without complying with the other requirements of this chapter relating to adoption of rules and may resubmit the change to the legislative council for publication provided:
  - a. The agency or commission initiates the request to the administrative rules committee for consideration of the amendment or repeal;
  - b. The agency or commission provides notice to the regulated community, in a manner reasonably calculated to provide notice to those persons interested in the rule, of the time and place the administrative rules committee will consider the request for amendment or repeal of the rule; and
  - c. The agency or commission and the administrative rules committee agree the rule amendment or repeal eliminates a provision that is obsolete or no longer in compliance with law and that no detriment would result to the substantive rights of the regulated community from the amendment or repeal.

#### **28-32-19. Publication of administrative code and code supplement.**

1. The legislative council shall compile, index, and publish all rules filed pursuant to this chapter in a publication which must be known as the North Dakota Administrative Code, in this chapter referred to as the code. The code also must contain all objections filed with the legislative council by the administrative rules committee pursuant to section 28-32-17. The legislative council shall revise all or part of the code as often as the legislative council determines necessary.
2. The legislative council may prescribe the format, style, and arrangement for rules to be published in the code and may refuse to accept the filing of any rule that is not in substantial compliance with the format, style, and arrangement. In arranging rules for publication, the legislative council may make corrections in spelling, grammatical construction, format, and punctuation of the rules as the legislative council determines are proper. The legislative council shall keep and maintain a permanent code of all rules filed, including superseded and repealed rules, which must be open to public inspection during office hours.

3. The legislative council shall compile and publish the North Dakota Administrative Code supplement according to the schedule of effective dates of rules in section 28-32-15.
  - a. The code supplement must contain all rules that have been filed with the legislative council or which have become effective since the compilation and publication of the preceding issue of the code supplement.
  - b. The code supplement must contain all objections filed with the legislative council by the administrative rules committee pursuant to section 28-32-17.
4. The legislative council, with the consent of the adopting agency or commission, may omit from the code or code supplement any rule the publication of which would be unduly cumbersome, expensive, or otherwise inexpedient, if the rule in printed or duplicated form is made available on application to the agency or commission, and if the code or code supplement contains a notice stating the general subject matter of the omitted rule and how a copy may be obtained.
5. The code must be arranged, indexed, and printed or duplicated in a manner to permit separate publication of portions thereof relating to individual agencies. An agency may print as many copies of such separate portions of the code as it may require. If the legislative council does not publish the code supplement due to technological problems or lack of funds, the agency whose rules would have been published in the code supplement shall provide a copy of the rules to any person upon request. The agency may charge a fee for a copy of the rules as allowed under section 44-04-18.

**28-32-20. Notification of code and code supplement.**

1. The legislative council shall publish the code and code supplement on the legislative branch website.
2. The secretary of state shall send electronic notification of quarterly updates to the code without charge to the following:
  - a. Governor.
  - b. Attorney general.
  - c. Each supreme court justice.
  - d. Each district court judge.
  - e. Each county auditor of this state.
  - f. Supreme court library.
  - g. State library.
  - h. Law library of the university of North Dakota.
  - i. Each of the five depository libraries in this state.
  - j. Upon request, to any person requesting electronic notification of quarterly updates to the code.
2. If applicable, the administrative code, revisions to the administrative code, and the code supplement must be considered sixth-class printing under sections 46-02-04 and 46-02-09.

**28-32-21. Adjudicative proceedings - Procedures.**

Administrative agencies shall comply with the following procedures in all adjudicative proceedings:

1.
  - a. For adjudicative proceedings involving a hearing on a complaint against a specific-named respondent, a complainant shall prepare and file a clear and concise complaint with the agency having subject matter jurisdiction of the proceeding. The complaint shall contain a concise statement of the claims or charges upon which the complainant relies, including reference to the statute or rule alleged to be violated, and the relief sought.
  - b. After a complaint is filed, the appropriate administrative agency shall serve a copy of the complaint upon the respondent in the manner allowed for the service of process under the North Dakota Rules of Civil Procedure at least forty-five days before the hearing on the complaint.
  - c. The administrative agency shall designate the time and place for the hearing and shall serve a copy of the notice of hearing upon the respondent in the manner

- allowed for service under the North Dakota Rules of Civil Procedure, at least twenty days before the hearing on the complaint. Service of the notice of hearing may be waived in writing by the respondent, or the parties may agree on a definite time and place for hearing with the consent of the agency having jurisdiction.
- d. A complaint may be served less than forty-five days before the time specified for a hearing on the complaint and a notice of hearing on a complaint may be served less than twenty days before the time specified for hearing if otherwise authorized by statute. However, an administrative hearing regarding the renewal, suspension, or revocation of a license may not be held fewer than ten days after the licensee has been served, personally or by certified mail, with a copy of a notice for hearing with an affidavit, complaint, specification of issues, or other document alleging violations upon which the license hearing is based.
  - e. A complaint may inform the respondent that an answer to the complaint must be served upon the complainant and the agency with which the complaint is filed within twenty days after service of the complaint, or the agency may deem the complaint to be admitted. If the respondent fails to answer as required within twenty days after service of the complaint, the agency may enter an order in default as the facts and law may warrant. Answers must be served in the manner allowed for service under the North Dakota Rules of Civil Procedure.
  - f. Service is complete upon compliance with the provisions of the North Dakota Rules of Civil Procedure. Proof of service may be made as provided in the North Dakota Rules of Civil Procedure.
  - g. A respondent may be given less than twenty days to answer the complaint, pursuant to another statute, but no respondent may be required to answer a complaint in less than five days and an answer must be served on the complainant and the agency with which the complaint is filed at least two days before the hearing on the complaint.
  - h. Amended and supplemental pleadings may be served and filed with the agency in the manner allowed for amended and supplemental pleadings under the North Dakota Rules of Civil Procedure.
2. At any hearing in an adjudicative proceeding, the parties shall be afforded opportunity to present evidence and to examine and cross-examine witnesses as is permitted under sections 28-32-24 and 28-32-35.
  3.
    - a. If the adjudicative proceeding does not involve a hearing on a complaint against a specific-named respondent, the provisions of subsection 1 do not apply. Unless otherwise provided by law, the provisions of subdivisions b through d apply.
    - b. The administrative agency shall designate the time and place for the hearing and shall serve a copy of the notice of hearing upon all the parties in the manner allowed for service under the North Dakota Rules of Civil Procedure at least twenty days before the hearing. Service of the notice of hearing may be waived in writing by the parties, or the parties may agree on a definite time and place for the hearing with the consent of the agency having jurisdiction.
    - c. A hearing under this subsection may not be held unless the parties have been properly served with a copy of the notice of hearing as well as a written specification of issues for hearing or other document indicating the issues to be considered and determined at the hearing. In lieu of, or in addition to, a specification of issues or other document, an explanation about the nature of the hearing and the issues to be considered and determined at the hearing may be contained in the notice.
    - d. Service is complete upon compliance with the provisions of the North Dakota Rules of Civil Procedure. Proof of service may be made as provided in the North Dakota Rules of Civil Procedure.

### **28-32-22. Informal disposition.**

Unless otherwise prohibited by specific statute or rule, informal disposition may be made of any adjudicative proceeding, or any part or issue thereof, by stipulation, settlement, waiver of hearing, consent order, default, alternative dispute resolution, or other informal disposition, subject to agency approval. Any administrative agency may adopt rules of practice or procedure for informal disposition if such rules do not substantially prejudice the rights of any party. Such rules may establish procedures for converting an administrative matter from one type of proceeding to another type of proceeding.

### **28-32-23. Adjudicative proceedings - Exceptions - Rules of procedure.**

Notwithstanding the requirements for standardization of procedures in adjudicative proceedings under this chapter, an administrative agency may adopt specific agency rules of procedure not inconsistent with this chapter. An administrative agency may also adopt specific agency rules of procedure when necessary to comply with requirements found elsewhere in this code or when necessary to comply with the requirements of federal statutes, rules, or standards.

### **28-32-24. Evidence to be considered by agency - Official notice.**

1. The admissibility of evidence in any adjudicative proceeding before an administrative agency shall be determined in accordance with the North Dakota Rules of Evidence. An administrative agency, or any person conducting proceedings for it, may waive application of the North Dakota Rules of Evidence if a waiver is necessary to ascertain the substantial rights of a party to the proceeding, but only relevant evidence shall be admitted. The waiver must be specifically stated, orally or in writing, either prior to or at a hearing or other proceeding.
2. All objections offered to evidence shall be noted in the record of the proceeding. No information or evidence except that which has been offered, admitted, and made a part of the official record of the proceeding shall be considered by the administrative agency, except as otherwise provided in this chapter.
3. Upon proper objection, evidence that is irrelevant, immaterial, unduly repetitious, or excludable on constitutional or statutory grounds, or on the basis of evidentiary privilege recognized in the courts of this state, may be excluded. In the absence of proper objection, the agency, or any person conducting a proceeding for it, may exclude objectionable evidence.
4. The North Dakota Rules of Evidence in regard to privileges apply at all stages of an administrative proceeding under this chapter.
5. All testimony must be made under oath or affirmation. Relevant statements presented by nonparties may be received as evidence if all parties are given an opportunity to cross-examine the nonparty witness or to otherwise challenge or rebut the statements. Nonparties may not examine or cross-examine witnesses except pursuant to a grant of intervention.
6. Evidence may be received in written form if doing so will expedite the proceeding without substantial prejudice to the interests of any party.
7. Official notice may be taken of any facts that could be judicially noticed in the courts of this state. Additionally, official notice may be taken of any facts as authorized in agency rules.

### **28-32-25. Adjudicative proceedings - Consideration of information not presented at a hearing.**

In any adjudicative proceeding, an administrative agency may avail itself of competent and relevant information or evidence in its possession or furnished by members of its staff, or secured from any person in the course of an independent investigation conducted by the agency, in addition to the evidence presented at the hearing. It may do so after first transmitting a copy of the information or evidence or an abstract thereof to each party of record in the proceeding. The agency must afford each party, upon written request, an opportunity to examine

the information or evidence and to present its own information or evidence and to cross-examine the person furnishing the information or evidence. Any further testimony that is necessary shall be taken at a hearing to be called and held, giving at least ten days' notice. Notice must be served upon the parties in the manner allowed for service under the North Dakota Rules of Civil Procedure. This section also applies to information officially noticed after the hearing when the issuance of any initial or final order is based in whole or in part on the facts or material noticed.

**28-32-26. Costs of investigation.**

An agency may assess the costs of an investigation to a person found to be in violation of a statute or rule as a result of an adjudicative proceeding or informal disposition. The total costs assessed and any civil penalty that may be imposed as a result of violation may not exceed the statutorily authorized civil penalty for the violation. For the purposes of this section, costs mean reasonable out-of-pocket agency costs, not including any attorney's fees, actually incurred in conducting the investigation for which they may be assessed. Any such costs paid must be paid into the general fund and are appropriated as a refund to the agency for the purposes of defraying the costs of undertaking the investigation.

**28-32-27. Hearing officer - Disqualification - Substitution.**

1. Any person or persons presiding for the agency in an administrative proceeding must be referred to individually or collectively as hearing officer. Any person from the office of administrative hearings presiding for the agency as a hearing officer in an administrative proceeding must be referred to as an administrative law judge.
2. Any hearing officer is subject to disqualification for good cause shown.
3. Any party may petition for the disqualification of any person presiding as a hearing officer upon discovering facts establishing grounds for disqualification.
4. A person whose disqualification is requested shall determine whether to grant the petition, stating facts and reasons for the determination.
5. If a substitute is required for a person who is disqualified or becomes unavailable for any other reason, the substitute may be appointed by:
  - a. The attorney general, if the disqualified or unavailable person is an assistant attorney general;
  - b. The agency head, if the disqualified or unavailable person is one or more members of the agency head or one or more other persons designated by the agency head;
  - c. A supervising hearing officer, if the disqualified or unavailable person is a hearing officer designated from an office, pool, panel, or division of hearing officers; or
  - d. The governor, in all other cases.
6. Any action taken by a duly appointed substitute for a disqualified or unavailable person is as effective as if taken by the disqualified or unavailable person.
7. Any hearing officer in an administrative proceeding, from the time of appointment or designation, may exercise any authority granted by law or rule. A hearing officer may be designated to preside over the entire administrative proceeding and may issue orders accordingly. A procedural hearing officer may only issue orders in regard to the course and conduct of the hearing under statute or rule and to otherwise effect an orderly hearing. If a procedural hearing officer is designated, the agency head must be present at the hearing and the agency head shall issue findings of fact and conclusions of law, as well as any order resulting from the hearing.

**28-32-28. Intervention.**

An administrative agency may grant intervention in an adjudicative proceeding to promote the interests of justice if intervention will not impair the orderly and prompt conduct of the proceeding and if the petitioning intervenor demonstrates that the petitioner's legal rights, duties, privileges, immunities, or other legal interests may be substantially affected by the proceeding or that the petitioner qualifies as an intervenor under any provision of statute or rule.

The agency may impose conditions and limitations upon intervention. The agency shall give reasonable notice of the intervention to all parties. An administrative agency may adopt rules relating to intervention in an adjudicative proceeding.

**28-32-29. Prehearing conference.**

Before a hearing, an administrative agency may conduct a prehearing conference after giving reasonable notice to all parties and other interested persons. A prehearing conference may be conducted in total or in part by making use of telephone, facsimile services, television, or other electronic means, as long as such use does not substantially prejudice or infringe on the rights and interests of any party. An administrative agency may adopt rules regarding the availability of, notice of, and procedures for prehearing conferences.

**28-32-30. Default.**

1. If a party fails to attend or participate in a prehearing conference, hearing, or other stage of an adjudicative proceeding, the agency may enter and serve upon all parties written notice of default and a default order, including a statement of the grounds for default.
2. Within seven days after service of the default notice, order, and grounds, the party against whom default was ordered may file a written motion requesting that the default order be vacated and stating the grounds relied upon. During the time within which a party may file a written motion under this section, or at the time of issuing notice and the default order, the agency may adjourn the proceedings or conduct them without the participation of the party against whom a default order was issued, having due regard for the interests of justice and the orderly and prompt conduct of the proceedings. If an agency conducts further proceedings necessary to complete the administrative action without the participation of a party in default, it shall determine all the issues involved, including those affecting the defaulting party.

**28-32-31. Duties of hearing officers.**

All hearing officers shall:

1. Assure that proper notice has been given as required by law.
2. Conduct only hearings and related proceedings for which proper notice has been given.
3. Assure that all hearings and related proceedings are conducted in a fair and impartial manner.
4. Make recommended findings of fact and conclusions of law and issue a recommended order, when appropriate.
5. Conduct the hearing only and perform such other functions of the proceeding as requested, when an agency requests a hearing officer to preside only as a procedural hearing officer. If the hearing officer is presiding only as a procedural hearing officer, the agency head must be present at the hearing and the agency head shall make findings of fact and conclusions of law and issue a final order. The agency shall give proper notice as required by law. The procedural hearing officer may issue orders in regard to the conduct of the hearing pursuant to statute or rule and to otherwise effect an orderly and prompt disposition of the proceedings.
6. Make findings of fact and conclusions of law and issue a final order, if required by statute or requested by an agency.
7. Function only as a procedural hearing officer, when an agency requests a hearing officer to preside for a rulemaking hearing. The agency head need not be present. The agency shall give proper notice as required by law.
8. Perform any and all other functions required by law, assigned by the director of administrative hearings, or delegated to the hearing officer by the agency.



### **28-32-32. Emergency adjudicative proceedings.**

An administrative agency may use an emergency adjudicative proceeding, in its discretion, in an emergency situation involving imminent peril to the public health, safety, or welfare.

1. In an emergency, the administrative agency may take action pursuant to a specific statute as is necessary to prevent or avoid imminent peril to the public health, safety, or welfare.
2. In an emergency, in the absence of a specific statute, an administrative agency may serve a complaint fewer than forty-five days before the hearing and give notice of a hearing on the complaint by giving less than twenty days' notice as is necessary to prevent or avoid imminent peril to the public health, safety, or welfare. But, every party to the emergency adjudicative proceeding must be given a reasonable time within which to serve an answer and to prepare for the hearing, which may be extended by the agency upon good cause being shown.
3. In an emergency, in the absence of a specific statute, in an adjudicative proceeding that does not involve a complaint against a specific-named respondent, an administrative agency may give notice of a hearing by giving less than twenty days' notice as is necessary to prevent or avoid imminent peril to the public health, safety, or welfare. But, every party to the emergency adjudicative proceeding shall be given a reasonable time to prepare for the hearing, which may be extended by the agency upon good cause being shown.
4. As a result of the emergency adjudicative proceeding, in the absence of a specific statute requiring other administrative action, the administrative agency shall issue an order. The order must include a brief statement of the reasons justifying the determination of imminent peril to the public health, safety, or welfare and requiring an emergency adjudicative proceeding to prevent or avoid the imminent peril.
5. After issuing an order pursuant to this section, the administrative agency shall proceed as soon as possible to complete any other proceedings related to the emergency adjudicative proceeding that do not involve imminent peril to the public health, safety, or welfare.

### **28-32-33. Adjudicative proceedings - Subpoenas - Discovery - Protective orders.**

1. In an adjudicative proceeding, discovery may be obtained in accordance with the North Dakota Rules of Civil Procedure.
2. In any adjudicative proceeding, upon the request or motion of any party to the proceeding or upon the hearing officer's own motion on behalf of the agency, a hearing officer may issue subpoenas, discovery orders, and protective orders in accordance with the North Dakota Rules of Civil Procedure. A motion to quash or modify, or any other motion relating to subpoenas, discovery, or protective orders must be made to the hearing officer. The hearing officer's rulings on these motions may be appealed under section 28-32-42 after issuance of the final order by the agency. The cost of issuing and serving a subpoena in any adjudicative proceeding must be paid by the person or agency requesting it.
3. Any witness who is subpoenaed under the provisions of this section and who appears at a hearing or other part of an adjudicative proceeding, or whose deposition is taken, shall receive the same fees and mileage as a witness in a civil case in the district court. Witness fees and mileage shall be paid by the party or agency at whose instance the witness appears. Any hearing officer may order the payment of witness fees or mileage by the appropriate party or agency.
4. Subpoenas, discovery orders, protective orders, and other orders issued under this section may be enforced by applying to any judge of the district court for an order requiring the attendance of a witness, the production of all documents and objects described in the subpoena, or otherwise enforcing an order. Failure of a witness or other person to comply with the order of the district court is contempt of court which is punishable by the district court, upon application. The judge may award attorney's fees to the prevailing party in an application under this subsection.

**28-32-34. Administration of oaths - Parties to be advised of perjury provisions.**

Any hearing officer in an administrative proceeding has the power to examine witnesses and records and to administer oaths to witnesses. At the time the person presiding administers the oath to a witness, the person shall advise the witness of the provisions of subsection 1 of section 12.1-11-01 and of the maximum penalty for perjury.

**28-32-35. Procedure at hearing.**

The person presiding at a hearing shall regulate the course of the hearing in conformity with this chapter and any rules adopted under this chapter by an administrative agency, any other applicable laws, and any prehearing order. To the extent necessary for full disclosure of all relevant facts and issues, the person presiding at the hearing shall afford to all parties and other persons allowed to participate the opportunity to respond, present evidence and argument, conduct cross-examination, and submit rebuttal evidence, except as restricted or conditioned by a grant of intervention or by a prehearing order. A hearing may be conducted in total or in part by making use of telephone, television, facsimile services, or other electronic means if each participant in the hearing has an opportunity to participate in, to hear, and, if practicable, to see the entire proceeding while it is taking place, and if such use does not substantially prejudice or infringe on the rights and interests of any party.

**28-32-36. Agency to make record.**

An administrative agency shall make a record of all testimony, written statements, documents, exhibits, and other evidence presented at any adjudicative proceeding or other administrative proceeding heard by it. Oral testimony may be taken by a court reporter, by a stenographer, or by use of an electronic recording device. All evidence presented at any proceeding before the administrative agency shall be filed with the agency. A copy of the record of any proceeding before an administrative agency, or a part thereof, must be furnished to any party to the proceeding and to any other person allowed to participate in the proceeding, upon written request submitted to the agency and upon payment of a uniform charge to be set by the agency. Any fee paid to an administrative agency for the record, or a part thereof, shall be paid into the general fund and is appropriated as a refund to the agency for the purposes of defraying the costs of preparing the record. An agency may contract with any person or another agency to prepare a record, or a part thereof, of any proceeding before the agency.

**28-32-37. Ex parte communications.**

1. Except as provided in subsections 2 and 4 or unless required for the disposition of ex parte matters specifically authorized by another statute, an agency head or hearing officer in an adjudicative proceeding may not communicate, directly or indirectly, regarding any issue in the proceeding, while the proceeding is pending, with any party, with any person who has a direct or indirect interest in the outcome of the proceeding, with any other person allowed to participate in the proceeding, or with any person who presided at a previous stage of the proceeding, without notice and opportunity for all parties to participate in the communication.
2. When more than one person is the hearing officer in an adjudicative proceeding, those persons may communicate with each other regarding a matter pending before the panel. An agency head or hearing officer may communicate with or receive aid from staff assistants if the assistants do not furnish, augment, diminish, or modify the evidence in the record.
3. Except as provided in subsection 4 or unless required for the disposition of ex parte matters specifically authorized by statute, no party to an adjudicative proceeding, no person who has a direct or indirect interest in the outcome of the proceeding, no person allowed to participate in the proceeding, and no person who presided at a previous stage in the proceeding may communicate directly or indirectly in connection with any issue in that proceeding, while the proceeding is pending, with any agency head or hearing officer in the proceeding without notice and opportunity for all parties to participate in the communication.

4. In an adjudicative proceeding conducted by a hearing officer other than the agency head, counsel for the administrative agency and the agency head, without notice and opportunity for all parties to participate, may communicate and consult regarding the status of the adjudicative proceeding, discovery, settlement, litigation decisions, and other matters commonly communicated between attorney and client, to permit the agency head to make informed decisions. This subsection does not apply after recommended findings of fact, conclusions of law, and orders have been issued, except counsel for the administrative agency and the agency head may communicate regarding settlement and negotiation after recommended findings of fact, conclusions of law, and orders have been issued.
5. If, before being assigned, designated, or appointed to preside in an adjudicative proceeding, a person receives an ex parte communication of a type that could not properly be received while presiding, the person, promptly after being assigned, designated, or appointed, shall disclose the communication in the manner prescribed in subsection 6.
6. An agency head or hearing officer in an adjudicative proceeding who receives an ex parte communication in violation of this section shall place on the record of the pending matter all written communications received, all written responses to the communications, or a memorandum stating the substance of all oral communications received, all responses made, and the identity of each person from whom the person received an ex parte oral communication, and shall advise all parties, interested persons, and other persons allowed to participate that these matters have been placed on the record. Any person desiring to rebut the ex parte communication must be allowed to do so, upon requesting the opportunity for rebuttal. A request for rebuttal must be made within ten days after notice of the communication.
7. If necessary to eliminate the effect of an ex parte communication received in violation of this section, an agency head or hearing officer in an adjudicative proceeding who receives the communication may be disqualified, upon good cause being shown in writing to the hearing officer or to the agency. The portions of the record pertaining to the communication may be sealed by protective order issued by the agency.
8. The agency shall, and any party may, report any willful violation of this section to the appropriate authorities for any disciplinary proceedings provided by law. In addition, an administrative agency may, by rule, provide for appropriate sanctions, including default, for any violations of this section.
9. Nothing in this section prohibits a member of the general public, not acting on behalf or at the request of any party, from communicating with an agency in cases of general interest. The agency shall disclose such written communications in adjudicative proceedings.

**28-32-38. Separation of functions.**

1. No person who has served as investigator, prosecutor, or advocate in the investigatory or prehearing stage of an adjudicative proceeding may serve as hearing officer.
2. No person who is subject to the direct authority of one who has served as an investigator, prosecutor, or advocate in the investigatory or prehearing stage of an adjudicative proceeding may serve as hearing officer.
3. Any other person may serve as hearing officer in an adjudicative proceeding, unless a party demonstrates grounds for disqualification.
4. Any person may serve as hearing officer at successive stages of the same adjudicative proceeding, unless a party demonstrates grounds for disqualification.

**28-32-39. Adjudicative proceedings - Findings of fact, conclusions of law, and order of agency - Notice.**

1. In an adjudicative proceeding an administrative agency shall make and state concisely and explicitly its findings of fact and its separate conclusions of law and the order of the agency based upon its findings and conclusions.

2. If the agency head, or another person authorized by the agency head or by law to issue a final order, is presiding, the order issued is the final order. The agency shall serve a copy of the final order and the findings of fact and conclusions of law on which it is based upon all the parties to the proceeding within thirty days after the evidence has been received, briefs filed, and arguments closed, or as soon thereafter as possible, in the manner allowed for service under the North Dakota Rules of Civil Procedure.
3. If the agency head, or another person authorized by the agency head or by law to issue a final order, is not presiding, then the person presiding shall issue recommended findings of fact and conclusions of law and a recommended order within thirty days after the evidence has been received, briefs filed, and arguments closed, or as soon thereafter as possible. The recommended findings of fact and conclusions of law and the recommended order become final unless specifically amended or rejected by the agency head. The agency head may adopt the recommended findings of fact and conclusions of law and the recommended order as final. The agency may allow petitions for review of a recommended order and may allow oral argument pending issuance of a final order. An administrative agency may adopt rules regarding the review of recommended orders and other procedures for issuance of a final order by the agency. If a recommended order is issued, the agency must serve a copy of any final order issued and the findings of fact and conclusions of law on which it is based upon all the parties to the proceeding within sixty days after the evidence has been received, briefs filed, and arguments closed, or as soon thereafter as possible, in the manner allowed for service under the North Dakota Rules of Civil Procedure.

**28-32-40. Petition for reconsideration.**

1. Any party before an administrative agency who is aggrieved by the final order of the agency, including the administrative agency when the hearing officer is not the agency head or one or more members of the agency head, within fifteen days after notice has been given as required by section 28-32-39, may file a petition for reconsideration with the agency. Filing of the petition is not a prerequisite for seeking judicial review. If the agency's hearing officer issues the agency's final order, the petition for reconsideration must be addressed to the hearing officer, who may grant or deny the petition under subsection 4.
2. Any party, including workforce safety and insurance, that appears before workforce safety and insurance may file a petition for reconsideration within thirty days after notice has been given as required by section 28-32-39.
3. The party must submit with the petition for reconsideration a statement of the specific grounds upon which relief is requested or a statement of any further showing to be made in the proceeding. The petition must also state whether a rehearing is requested. The petition and any statement shall be considered a part of the record in the proceeding.
4. The administrative agency may deny the petition for reconsideration or may grant the petition on such terms as it may prescribe. If a rehearing is granted, the agency may allow a new hearing or limit the hearing as appropriate. The agency may dissolve or amend the final order and set the matter for further hearing. The petition is deemed to have been denied if the agency does not dispose of it within thirty days after the filing of the petition. Any rehearing must be presided over by the same person or persons presiding previously at the hearing, if available. Any amended findings, conclusions, and orders must be issued by the same person or persons who issued the previous recommended or final orders, if available. Within thirty days after the close of proceedings upon reconsideration, or as soon thereafter as possible, the agency shall issue and give notice of its order upon reconsideration as required in subsection 3 of section 28-32-39.
5. This section does not limit the right of any agency to reopen any proceeding or rehear any matter under any continuing jurisdiction which is granted to the agency by statute.

#### **28-32-41. Effectiveness of orders.**

Unless a later date is stated in the order, a final order of an administrative agency is effective immediately, but a party may not be required to comply with a final order unless it has been served upon the party and notice is deemed given pursuant to section 28-32-39 or the party has actual knowledge of the final order. A nonparty may not be required to comply with a final order unless the agency has made the final order available for public inspection and copying or the nonparty has actual knowledge of the final order. This section does not preclude an agency from taking emergency action to protect the public health, safety, or welfare as authorized by statute.

#### **28-32-42. Appeal from determination of agency - Time to appeal - How appeal taken.**

1. Any party to any proceeding heard by an administrative agency, except when the order of the administrative agency is declared final by any other statute, may appeal from the order within thirty days after notice of the order has been given as required by section 28-32-39. If a reconsideration has been requested as provided in section 28-32-40, the party may appeal within thirty days after notice of the final determination upon reconsideration has been given as required by sections 28-32-39 and 28-32-40. If an agency does not dispose of a petition for reconsideration within thirty days after the filing of the petition, the agency is deemed to have made a final determination upon which an appeal may be taken.
2. Any interested person who has participated in the rulemaking process of an administrative agency may appeal the agency's rulemaking action if the appeal is taken within ninety days after the date of publication in the North Dakota Administrative Code of the rule resulting from the agency rulemaking action.
3.
  - a. The appeal of an order may be taken to the district court designated by law, and if none is designated, then to the district court of the county in which the hearing or a part thereof was held. If the administrative proceeding was disposed of informally, or for some other reason no hearing was held, an appeal may be taken to the district court of Burleigh County. Only final orders are appealable. A procedural order made by an administrative agency while a proceeding is pending before it is not a final order.
  - b. The appeal of an agency's rulemaking action may be taken to the district court of Burleigh County.
4. An appeal shall be taken by serving a notice of appeal and specifications of error specifying the grounds on which the appeal is taken, upon the administrative agency concerned, upon the attorney general or an assistant attorney general, and upon all the parties to the proceeding before the administrative agency, and by filing the notice of appeal and specifications of error together with proof of service of the notice of appeal, and the undertaking required by this section, with the clerk of the district court to which the appeal is taken. In an appeal of an agency's rulemaking action, only the administrative agency concerned, the attorney general, or an assistant attorney general, as well as the legislative council, need to be notified.
5. The notice of appeal must specify the parties taking the appeal as appellants. The agency and all other parties of record who are not designated as appellants must be named as appellees. A notice of appeal of agency rulemaking actions need not name all persons participating in the rulemaking proceeding as appellees. The agency and all parties of record have the right to participate in the appeal. In the appeal of agency rulemaking action, any person who has participated in the rulemaking process has the right to participate in the appeal.
6. A bond or other undertaking for costs on appeal must be filed by the appellant as is required by appellants for costs on appeal in civil cases under the rules of appellate procedure. The bond or other undertaking must be filed with the clerk of the district court with the notice of appeal, must be made to the state of North Dakota, and may be enforced by the agency concerned for and on behalf of the state as obligee. A bond or other undertaking is not required when filing fees have been waived by a district court pursuant to section 27-01-07 or when the costs of preparation and filing of the

record of administrative agency proceedings have been waived by a district court pursuant to subsection 3 of section 28-32-44.

**28-32-43. Docketing of appeals.**

Appeals taken in accordance with this chapter must be docketed as other cases pending in the district court are docketed and must be heard and determined by the court without a jury at such time as the court shall determine.

**28-32-44. Agency to maintain and certify record on appeal.**

1. An administrative agency shall maintain an official record of each adjudicative proceeding or other administrative proceeding heard by it.
2. Within thirty days, or a longer time as the court by order may direct, after an appeal has been taken to the district court as provided in this chapter, and after payment by the appellant of the estimated cost of preparation and filing of the entire record of the proceedings before the agency, the administrative agency concerned shall prepare and file in the office of the clerk of the district court in which the appeal is pending the original or a certified copy of the entire record of proceedings before the agency, or an abstract of the record as may be agreed upon and stipulated by the parties. Upon receiving a copy of the notice of appeal and specifications of error pursuant to subsection 4 of section 28-32-42 and unless the agency is appealing, the administrative agency shall notify the party appealing of the estimated costs of preparation and filing of the record. Thereafter, unless the agency is appealing, the party appealing shall pay the administrative agency the estimated costs required by this subsection. If the actual costs of preparation and filing of the entire record of the proceedings is greater than the estimated costs, the party appealing shall pay to the agency the difference. If the actual costs are less than the estimated costs, the agency shall pay to the party appealing the difference. Any payment for the costs of preparation and filing of the record must be paid into the insurance recovery fund and is appropriated as a refund to the agency for the purposes of defraying the costs of preparing and filing the record. An agency may contract with any person or another agency to prepare and file the record of any proceeding before the agency.
3. The cost of preparation and filing of the record may be waived by the district court upon application by an appellant, showing that the appellant is a low-income person unable to afford these costs. When a waiver is granted, the costs of preparation and filing of the record must be paid by the administrative agency.
4. The agency record of the proceedings, as applicable, may consist of only the following:
  - a. The complaint, answer, and other initial pleadings or documents.
  - b. Notices of all proceedings.
  - c. Any prehearing notices, transcripts, documents, or orders.
  - d. Any motions, pleadings, briefs, petitions, requests, and intermediate rulings.
  - e. A statement of matters officially noticed.
  - f. Offers of proof and objections and rulings thereon.
  - g. Proposed findings, requested orders, and exceptions.
  - h. The transcript of the hearing prepared for the person presiding at the hearing, including all testimony taken, and any written statements, exhibits, reports, memoranda, documents, or other information or evidence considered before final disposition of proceedings.
  - i. Any recommended or proposed order, recommended or proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, final order, final findings of fact and conclusions of law, or findings of fact and conclusions of law or orders on reconsideration.
  - j. Any information considered pursuant to section 28-32-25.
  - k. Matters placed on the record after an ex parte communication.
5. Except to the extent that this chapter or another statute provides otherwise, the agency record constitutes the exclusive basis for administrative agency action and judicial review of an administrative agency action.

6. The record on review of agency rulemaking action, as applicable, may consist of only the following:
  - a. All agency notices concerning proposed rulemaking.
  - b. A copy of the proposed rule upon which written and oral submissions were made.
  - c. A copy of the rule as submitted for publication.
  - d. Any opinion letters by the attorney general as to a rule's legality or the legality of the agency's rulemaking action.
  - e. A copy of any interim rule and the agency's findings and statement of the reasons for an interim rule.
  - f. The regulatory analysis of a proposed rule.
  - g. The transcript of any oral hearing on a proposed rule.
  - h. All written submissions made to the agency on a proposed rule.
  - i. Any staff memoranda or data prepared for agency consideration in regard to the proposed rule.
  - j. Any other document that the agency believes is relevant to the appeal.
  - k. Any other document that is not privileged and which is a public record that the appellant requests the agency to include in the record, if relevant to the appeal.
7. If the notice of appeal specifies that no exception or objection is made to the agency's findings of fact, and that the appeal is concerned only with the agency's conclusions of law based on the facts found by it, the agency may submit an abstract of the record along with such portions of the record as the agency deems necessary, to be supplemented by those portions of the record requested to be submitted by the appellant or by the other party when the agency is appealing.
8. The court may permit amendments or additions to the record filed by the administrative agency in order to complete the record.

**28-32-45. Consideration of additional or excluded evidence.**

If an application for leave to offer additional testimony, written statements, documents, exhibits, or other evidence is made to the court in which an appeal from a determination of an administrative agency is pending, and it is shown to the satisfaction of the court that the additional evidence is relevant and material and that there were reasonable grounds for the failure to offer the evidence in the hearing or proceeding, or that the evidence is relevant and material to the issues involved and was rejected or excluded by the agency, the court may order that the additional evidence be taken, heard, and considered by the agency on terms and conditions as the court may deem proper. After considering the additional evidence, the administrative agency may amend or reject its findings of fact, conclusions of law, and order and shall file with the court a transcript of the additional evidence with its new or amended findings of fact, conclusions of law, and order, if any, which constitute a part of the record with the court.

**28-32-46. Scope of and procedure on appeal from determination of administrative agency.**

A judge of the district court must review an appeal from the determination of an administrative agency based only on the record filed with the court. After a hearing, the filing of briefs, or other disposition of the matter as the judge may reasonably require, the court must affirm the order of the agency unless it finds that any of the following are present:

1. The order is not in accordance with the law.
2. The order is in violation of the constitutional rights of the appellant.
3. The provisions of this chapter have not been complied with in the proceedings before the agency.
4. The rules or procedure of the agency have not afforded the appellant a fair hearing.
5. The findings of fact made by the agency are not supported by a preponderance of the evidence.
6. The conclusions of law and order of the agency are not supported by its findings of fact.
7. The findings of fact made by the agency do not sufficiently address the evidence presented to the agency by the appellant.

8. The conclusions of law and order of the agency do not sufficiently explain the agency's rationale for not adopting any contrary recommendations by a hearing officer or an administrative law judge.

If the order of the agency is not affirmed by the court, it must be modified or reversed, and the case shall be remanded to the agency for disposition in accordance with the order of the court.

**28-32-47. Scope of and procedure on appeal from agency rulemaking.**

1. A judge of the district court shall review an appeal from an administrative agency's or ethics commission's rulemaking action based only on the record filed with the court. If an appellant requests documents to be included in the record but the agency or commission does not include them, the court, upon application by the appellant, may compel their inclusion. After a hearing, the filing of briefs, or other disposition of the matter as the judge may reasonably require, the court shall affirm the rulemaking action unless it finds that any of the following are present:
  - a. The provisions of this chapter have not been substantially complied with in the rulemaking actions.
  - b. A rule published as a result of the rulemaking action appealed is unconstitutional on the face of the language adopted.
  - c. A rule published as a result of the rulemaking action appealed is beyond the scope of the agency's or commission's authority to adopt.
  - d. A rule published as a result of the rulemaking action appealed is on the face of the language adopted an arbitrary or capricious application of authority granted by statute.
2. If the rulemaking action of the agency or commission is not affirmed by the court, the rulemaking action must be remanded to the agency or commission for disposition in accordance with the order of the court, or the rule or a portion of the rule resulting from the rulemaking action of the agency or commission must be declared invalid for reasons stated by the court.

**28-32-48. Appeal - Stay of proceedings.**

An appeal from an order or the rulemaking action of an administrative agency or the commission does not stay the enforcement of the order or the effect of a published rule unless the court to which the appeal is taken, upon application and after a hearing or the submission of briefs, orders a stay. The court may impose terms and conditions for a stay of the enforcement of the order or for a stay in the effect of a published rule. This section does not prohibit the operation of an automatic stay upon the enforcement of an administrative order or commission order as may be required by another statute.

**28-32-49. Review in supreme court.**

The judgment of the district court in an appeal from an order or rulemaking action of an administrative agency or the commission may be reviewed in the supreme court on appeal in the same manner as provided in section 28-32-46 or 28-32-47, except that the appeal to the supreme court must be taken within sixty days after the service of the notice of entry of judgment in the district court. Any party of record, including the agency or commission, may take an appeal from the final judgment of the district court to the supreme court. If an appeal from the judgment of the district court is taken by an agency or the commission, the agency or commission may not be required to pay a docket fee or file a bond for costs or equivalent security.

**28-32-50. Actions against administrative agencies - Attorney's fees and costs.**

1. In any civil judicial proceeding involving as adverse parties an administrative agency and a party not an administrative agency or an agent of an administrative agency, the court must award the party not an administrative agency reasonable attorney's fees and costs if the court finds in favor of that party and, in the case of a final agency order, determines that the administrative agency acted without substantial justification.



2. This section applies to an administrative or civil judicial proceeding brought by a party not an administrative agency against an administrative agency for judicial review of a final agency order, or for judicial review pursuant to this chapter of the legality of agency rulemaking action or a rule adopted by an agency as a result of the rulemaking action being appealed.
3. Any attorney's fees and costs awarded pursuant to this section must be paid from funds available to the administrative agency the final order, rulemaking action, or rule of which was reviewed by the court. The court may withhold all or part of the attorney's fees from any award if the court finds the administrative agency's action, in the case of a final agency order, was substantially justified or that special circumstances exist which make the award of all or a portion of the attorney's fees unjust.
4. This section does not alter the rights of a party to collect any fees under other applicable law.
5. In any civil judicial proceeding involving adverse parties to an appeal or enforcement action involving an environmental permit issued under chapter 23.1-04, 23.1-06, 23.1-08, or 61-28 in which two or more of the adverse parties are not an administrative agency or an agent of an administrative agency, the court may award the prevailing nonagency party reasonable attorney's fees and costs if the court finds in favor of that party and determines that the nonprevailing nonagency party acted without substantial justification, or on the basis of claims or allegations that are factually unsupported. The court shall award reasonable attorney's fees and costs if the court determines that the nonprevailing nonagency party's claims or allegations are frivolous as provided in section 28-26-01. If the appeal or civil judicial proceeding covered by this subsection involves multiple claims or allegations, the court may apportion attorney's fees and costs in proportion to the time reasonably spent by a prevailing party relating to claims pursued by the nonprevailing party that were frivolous, factually unsupported, or without substantial justification.

**28-32-51. Witnesses - Immunity.**

If any person objects to testifying or producing evidence, documentary or otherwise, at any proceeding before an administrative agency, claiming a privilege against self-incrimination, but is directed to testify or produce evidence pursuant to the written approval of the attorney general, that person must comply with the direction but no testimony or evidence compelled from that person, after a valid claim of privilege against self-incrimination has been made, may be used against that person in any criminal proceeding subjecting that person to a penalty or forfeiture. No person testifying at any proceeding before an administrative agency may be exempted from prosecution and punishment for perjury or giving a false statement, or for contempt committed in answering, or failing to answer, or in producing, or in failing to produce, evidence pursuant to direction given under this section.

**28-32-52. Elected official authority.**

This chapter does not prohibit an elected official from presiding at that agency's cases, nor from deciding cases within that agency's jurisdiction.